Name of Lesson: Discovering the Evaluative Thinking Process

Topic: Evaluative Thinking

Gifted Standard and element(s):
Standard 3: Students will evaluate and solve a variety of authentic problems. G1CG3
  b. Explore the evaluative thinking process.
  f. Develop verbal and nonverbal communication skills to share evaluative thinking.
  g. Collaborate with peers in the evaluative thinking process.

Common Core Georgia Performance Standards:
ELACC1SL1: Participate in collaborative conversations with diverse partners about grade 1 topics and texts with peers and adults in small and larger groups.
  b. Build on others’ talk in conversations by responding to the comments of others through multiple exchanges.
  c. Ask questions to clear up any confusion about the topics and texts under discussion.
ELACC1SL3: Ask and answer questions about key details in a text read aloud or information presented orally or through other media.

Essential Question(s):
What is the evaluative thinking process?

Lesson Questions:
1. How do I explore the evaluative thinking process?
2. How can I develop verbal and nonverbal communication skills to share evaluative thinking?
3. How can I collaborate with my peers in the evaluative thinking process?

Lesson Summary:
The purpose of this lesson is to explore critical thinking through the use of the evaluative thinking process. Students will use the evaluative thinking process to solve an authentic problem. Students will collaborate and communicate with their peers in order to solve a variety of problems using the Evaluative Thinking Process.

Assessment Description/Performance Task:
- [ ] Constructed response
- [ ] Informal assessment
- [x] Performance task
- [ ] Selected response

Brief Description of Assessment:
Teacher will supply to students “The Way to Evaluative Thinking” template cut into strips for the students to illustrate and arrange correctly in their iPETS interactive notebook. Teacher will use the “Behavioral Checklist” included with lesson to assess the following areas:
- Logically Supported Responses – Teacher will look for students who state opinions and can follow up their opinions with logical reasoning (evaluative thinking).
- Draws valid conclusions based upon considerations (evaluative thinking) – Teacher will look for students who can accurately apply valid criteria in order to help narrow the field of many choices regardless of their own personal preferences.

Instructional Methods:
Teaching Strategy: Hook/Activator/Teacher Model
1. I have two dogs, Tommy and Ruby. (Show pictures of “Tommy” and “Ruby”.) I walk my dogs every Saturday on their leashes. There is a mean dog that lives in one of the houses that I have to pass in order to give Tommy and Ruby a chance to visit their favorite park. Show picture of “Mean Dog.” Sometimes, if we are lucky, the mean dog is locked up. When he is not locked up, he runs out and barks and snarls at me and my dogs as we walk by. I am very afraid that this dog is going to bite my dogs someday. I need to solve this problem. My dogs told me about a friend they met last week at the vet’s office. His name is Jordan and he is an owl. I found an e-mail that Jordan sent to Tommy and Ruby that I will share. (Display “The Way to Evaluative Thinking” signpost) Jordan said that this process would help us come up with the best solution. He calls this process “The Evaluative Thinking Process”. I will model this process to demonstrate how to apply this to our
problem.

- **Define the problem.** A mean dog lives on the path that I use when walking my dogs. I am fearful that he may attack either my dogs or me.

- **Analyze the problem.** The fear that I have when I think about the mean dog makes my Saturday walks unpleasant. This exercise should be a pleasant experience.

- **Establish goals.** I want to walk my dogs without being afraid. I am sure that if I am concerned, other people in my neighborhood also are worried about a vicious, unleashed animal. My goal is to be sure that the mean dog is never unleashed.

- **Generate possible solutions.**
  - Stop taking my dogs on a walk
  - Walk a different path
  - Talk to the owners of the dog
  - Ask Cesar Millan the Dog Whisperer to come and hypnotize the mean dog and make him nice
  - Call county Animal Control to report the violation of the leash law

- **Rank the solutions.**
  - Walk a different path
  - Talk to the owners of the dog
  - Call county Animal Control to report the violation of the leash law
  - Stop taking my dogs on a walk
  - Ask Cesar Millan the Dog Whisperer to come and hypnotize the mean dog and make him nice

- **Research and explore a solution.** The easiest solution is to walk a different path. If I talked to the dog’s owners, they may not be nice. After all, they have a mean dog as a pet, right? Not to mention, I am terrified to step foot on their property. Animal Control would have to see the violation happening, so this would not solve my problem quickly. Cesar Millan charges a fortune and is on an Alaskan cruise for the next month. I decided that my dogs and I would take a different route. We decided to try this new idea. Instead of turning right out of our neighborhood, we turn left.

- **Evaluate the effectiveness of the chosen solution.** This was an excellent idea. Not only do we have a peaceful walk but we have made new friends and take our dogs to the dog park together. This path does take longer, but Ruby and Tommy LOVE the extra time outside.

- **Was the solution effective?** Yes, we no longer need to be fearful when we are taking our walks.

- **Implement and defend the chosen solution.** The solution we chose was effective. We now go for walks every Saturday and it is more enjoyable than ever before.

- Share with your students that sometimes a decision can be difficult. It is always good to have a professional “evaluative thinker” to help you through the process. Your friend Jordan the Judge is just who you need and you plan to introduce your students to him in their next lesson.
2. **Guide** use of “The Evaluative Thinking Process” using “Hilary’s Wish” scenario. Teacher and students will work together using verbal and nonverbal communication skills to share the *evaluative thinking process*. As you are discussing Hilary’s authentic problem, show students the visual of “Hilary’s Wish.” Work through the Evaluative Thinking Process using the sample dialog below.

*When discussing Hilary’s Wish, we will share ideas verbally and nonverbally. When we are sharing verbally, we express our ideas with our voice. When we are expressing our ideas nonverbally, we are not talking about our ideas, but manipulating or thinking about ideas in your head. Sometimes when we are expressing ideas with pictures and/or symbols we are using our nonverbal thinking. Display ”The Way to Evaluative Thinking” Template and work through the process using your whiteboard, or an overhead transparency.*

- **Define the problem.** First, what does define actually mean? Define means to tell what it is. For example: An apple is defined as a round fruit with red, yellow, or green skin. Knowing this, if we were to define Hilary’s problem, what would it be? Hilary wants a pet but there are many things that prevent her from having the pet of her choice (cat or dog).

- **Analyze the problem.** Analyze means to study closely the details and determine meaning. What are the reasons Hilary does not currently have a pet?
  - Hilary lives in an apartment that does not allow pets.
  - Hilary’s sister sneezes every time she is around cats or dogs.

- **Establish goals.** A goal is something a person wants and tries to get. Hilary wants a pet.

- **Generate possible solutions.** This means to brainstorm possible ideas to achieve your established goal to “Hilary’s Pet” situation. Some solutions may be:
  - Move
  - Ask mom to take her sister for allergy shots
  - Tell the apartment manager you would love to have a parrot just like his and see what he says
  - Think about having another pet
  - Give up the idea of having a pet

- **Rank or judge and decide the solutions.** Give the students the opportunity to list their ideas on paper nonverbally by manipulating ideas in their head. Rank their solutions in order from what would be “most likely” solution that could solve the problem to the “least likely” solution. Tell the students that we will discuss all of our ideas verbally; speaking with our voices once we all have a chance to think nonverbally. After 2 minutes, guide students to a “most likely” solution.
  - Think about having another kind of pet
  - Give up the idea of having a pet
  - Tell the apartment manager you would love to have a parrot just like his and see what he says
  - Move
  - Ask mom to take her sister for allergy shots

- **Research and explore a solution.** – The most likely solution would be to think about getting another kind of pet. After much research, Hilary thought of a few possibilities. She would need to get the approval of the apartment manager first, but how could he refuse if the pet were quiet, clean, does not shed or tear up furniture, and does not have fleas. Fish are quiet, clean and easy to keep. Hilary’s sister would not need to worry about sneezing.
• **Evaluate the effectiveness of the chosen solution.** Having a pet is a wonderful thing and it teaches responsibility and a love for nature. Hilary has come to the realization that she will not have what her heart desired which was a dog or a cat. However, she can still reap the benefits of having something she can call her own, take care of, talk to, and love. Fish are wonderful pets, you can get many of them and name them using your divergent thinking, plus, they are an affordable option.

• **Was the solution effective?** Yes, getting fish is effective for the given situation. Things change and soon she may move into a home or different apartment which would allow more of a variety of pets. If she were to move into a home, she may be able to have an outdoor pet which could be a dog or cat. Her sister will be leaving for Harvard next year, and not only will Hillary get her large bedroom, but may also be able to rescue a dog or cat from the Humane Society without worrying about allergies.

• **Implement and defend the chosen solution.** The apartment manager agreed for Hilary to have fish. She purchased a large tank and has many beautiful colorful fish swimming among plants and rocks. They are named Jonas, Penelope, Rico Suave, Groucho Marx and Madonna. It is very peaceful to watch the fish at night when she is laying in her bed. She is very happy with her decision and hopes that one day a dog or cat may join her on her bed at night enjoying the fish as well.

**Summary by the Learner: Performance Task**

Students will demonstrate learning by completing the following and placing it in their iPETS interactive notebook. Have students work together as a table or group. Explain that they will **collaborate** which means to discuss and work together in order to complete the following:

1. Give the students “The Way to Evaluative Thinking” cut into individual strips. Have the students work through each step to arrange them in the correct order. Once they are done, give each student a copy of “The Way to Evaluative Thinking” for their iPETS interactive notebook.

2. Working together as a group or small groups, students use the evaluative thinking **process** and “The Way to Evaluative Thinking” Template to solve one of the “Authentic Problems For Evaluative Thinkers.” Students will work through the problem and develop an effective solution. Remind them that they must work verbally and nonverbally to solve the problem.

3. With your group, **Verbally** work through the process to come to the most effective solution.

4. **Nonverbally**, complete the Evaluative Thinking Template. Have students prepare a written explanation defending their decision in their iPETS interactive notebook.

5. After working through the process, the students may share their solutions with an elbow partner. They may then place their completed solution and template in their iPETS interactive notebook.

6. As this process occurs, the teacher should use the “Behavioral Checklist” to access student understanding.

**Collaborative Group Practice**

**Less Capable**

The teacher will work with a small group of students to guide the students when solving ”Authentic Problems For Evaluative Thinkers.” Be sure to use “The Way to Evaluative Thinking“ template and work through the process encouraging students to use verbal and nonverbal thinking. Once completed, the students place their template in their iPETS interactive notebook.

**Materials for this Lesson:**

The story of “Hilary’s Pet”

“Behavioral Checklist”

"Authentic Problems For Evaluative Thinkers”

iPETS interactive notebook

“The Way to Evaluative Thinking” Template
Vocabulary for this Lesson in Alphabox in iPETS interactive notebook:

- Define
- Defend
- Authentic
- Analyze
- Rank
- Establish
- Goals
- Generate
- Solutions
- Research
- Explore
- Evaluate
- Effectiveness
- Implement
- Collaborate
- Verbally
- Nonverbally

Extension:

1. Create your own authentic problem and solution. Share with the class next week.

2. Word Splash - When the students enter the classroom and see the new words, their interest is peaked and they are motivated to learn what they mean and why they are there. The teacher then invites them to try and read the words and guess what they mean. These predictions help their brains to organize and assimilate the new vocabulary. As the students read and learn about the content area topic, they add pictures to the vocabulary words that represent their definitions. The word splash can then be used as a study aid to help students interact with and recall the words.

- Define, Analyze, Rank, Establish, Goals, Generate, Solutions, Research, Explore, Evaluate, Effectiveness, Implement, collaborate, verbally, nonverbally

3. Teachers can use the Word Splash to sum up a unit of study by using the vocabulary words as a category in a jeopardy-style game or by having the students quiz the principal. The students can also demonstrate their knowledge by using the original Word Splash cards or stickers as the basis of an informative hallway bulletin board for other classes to read and learn from.
# Behavioral Checklist

| List names of students as each behavior appears. Add checkmarks after name if behavior is repeated. Use a different color of ink or pencil for each whole group lesson. | Teacher ________________  
1st Grade  
Date ________________ |
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>LOGICALLY SUPPORTS RESPONSES</strong></td>
<td><strong>DRAWS VALID CONCLUSIONS BASED UPON CONSIDERATIONS DEVELOPED IN THE LESSON</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Fashion Faux Paw

Your problem is your clothes. Your mother buys all of your clothes for you. She usually picks out colors that you do not like and styles that you feel are for babies, like green overalls with kittens or puppies on them. Mom will not let you shop and pick out your own clothes. She says as long as she is paying for them, she gets to choose them. Since you don’t have any of your own money to shop for your own clothes, you are stuck wearing those that you intensely dislike.

I Wheely Want A New Bike

You think that you need a new bike. Your old bike is too small for you and you hit your knees on the handlebars while riding. You even fell last week and knocked out your two front teeth while trying to ride with your friends! Your parents say that they cannot afford a new bike right now. They want you to wait until your birthday, but your birthday is nine months away. You don’t want to wait until then. All of your friends have bigger bikes and are able to pass you when you ride together in the neighborhood. You are stuck pedaling like crazy in order to keep up with them.
RUBY
Tommy
Mean Dog
Hillary’s Wish

Hillary

or

Problem

and

Possible Solutions?

What solution did she choose and why?
The Way to Evaluative Thinking

Define the problem

Analyze the problem

Establish goals

Generate possible solutions

Rank the solutions

Research and explore a solution

Evaluate the effectiveness of the chosen solution. Was the solution effective?

Implement and defend the chosen solution
The Way to Evaluative Thinking Template

NAME_____________________________________________________

Define the authentic problem (what needs to be solved?)
__________________________________________________________________________

Analyze the problem (what are the details about the situation)
__________________________________________________________________________
__________________________________________________________________________
__________________________________________________________________________

Establish goals (what do you hope to accomplish?)
__________________________________________________________________________
__________________________________________________________________________

Generate many possible solutions (use your divergent thinking)
__________________________________________________________________________
__________________________________________________________________________
__________________________________________________________________________

Rank the solutions (judge and decide which is best to least)
__________________________________________________________________________
__________________________________________________________________________
__________________________________________________________________________

Research and explore a solution (find out facts about your solution)
__________________________________________________________________________
__________________________________________________________________________
__________________________________________________________________________

Evaluate the effectiveness of the chosen solution. Was the solution effective? (What part of solution works? What part does not work?)
__________________________________________________________________________
__________________________________________________________________________
__________________________________________________________________________

Implement and defend the chosen solution (Try it, tell why your choice was a good one or think about what another solution might be)
__________________________________________________________________________
__________________________________________________________________________
__________________________________________________________________________
Word Splash Words

Define   Defend
Authentic
Analyze
Rank
Establish Goals
Generate
Solutions
Research
Explore
Evaluate
Effectiveness
Implement
Collaborate
Verbally
Nonverbally
The Way to Evaluative Thinking

- Define the problem
- Analyze the problem
- Establish goals.
- Generate possible solutions.
- Rank the solutions.
- Research and explore a solution.
- Evaluate the effectiveness of the chosen solution.
- Was the solution effective?
- Implement and defend the chosen solution.